



**World Bank and Inter-American Development Bank (IDB):
Haiti Post-Earthquake Track Record on Gender, Agriculture and Rural
Development**

Elaine Zuckerman, Elise Young and Lisa Vitale
Fall 2010

Copyright © Gender Action 2010

About Gender Action

Gender Action was established in 2002. It is the only organization dedicated to promoting gender justice and women's rights in all International Financial Institution (IFI) investments such as those of the World Bank.

Gender Action's goal is to ensure that women and men equally participate in and benefit from all IFI investments.

Gender Action

1875 Connecticut Avenue NW

Suite 500

Washington DC 20009, USA

Tel: (202) 939-5463

Email: info@genderaction.org

<http://www.genderaction.org>



World Bank and Inter-American Development Bank (IDB): Haiti Post-Earthquake Track Record on Gender, Agriculture and Rural Development Fall 2010

Elaine Zuckerman, Elise Young and Lisa Vitale¹

Introduction to World Bank & Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) Post-Earthquake Grants

The newest global food crisis has struck at an especially vulnerable time for the world's poor, making food increasingly unaffordable and reducing incomes of impoverished farmers, the majority of whom are women. In light of the impact of rising food prices affecting impoverished Haitians during post-earthquake recovery efforts, Gender Action is tracking the gender sensitivity and social impacts of recent World Bank and IDB agriculture and rural development investments in the country. Our goal is to ensure that these two public taxpayer-supported banks diminish rather than exacerbate Haiti's acute food insecurity.

The World Bank and IDB are two of Haiti's largest and most influential donors and policy advisors. Thanks to Haitian and global civil society advocacy as well as Haitian and foreign government influence, the World Bank and IDB have forgiven Haitian loan debt and positioned all post-earthquake funding in the form of grants.² Since the earthquake, the IDB has approved 44 grants and the World Bank 7 grants for Haiti.³ Gender Action has screened these grants to assess the extent and quality of their rural and gender content. We found that the vast majority of World Bank and IDB post-earthquake grants to Haiti neither focus on agriculture and rural development, nor on the role of women. As of mid-October, only one World Bank and three IDB grants targeted the rural sector. Both banks focus most of their post-earthquake expenditures on rebuilding earthquake-destroyed infrastructure such as government ministries and registries, shelters and water supply. Contrary to both banks' gender policy requirements, few World Bank and IDB post-earthquake grants to Haiti are explicitly gender sensitive, not even security-related programs that bring portable electricity to shelters. Hence, these post-earthquake donor projects represent lost opportunities to help poor Haitian farmers who are mostly women, prevent gender-based violence, and explicitly target more gender-inclusive development efforts.

A World Bank gender assessment prepared for first round funding for a pre-earthquake rural community development project and an IDB gender assessment connected to a pre-earthquake shelter project, ideally provide resources for gender-sensitive post-earthquake projects.⁴ However,

¹ Elaine Zuckerman is President, and Lisa Vitale is Executive and Communications Assistant, of Gender Action, www.genderaction.org. Elise Young is a Gender Action Haiti Consultant.

² Both banks private arms, the International Finance Corporation and the Inter-American Investment Corporation, continue to make loans to private corporations in Haiti.

³ Through mid-October 2010.

⁴ The gender assessment is contained in a pre-earthquake approved, post-earthquake implemented World Bank project in Haiti with attention to gender: the \$5 million "Strengthening the Management of Agriculture Public Services (GFRP)" project approved in 2009 that

these reports are neither public nor reflected in the banks' post-earthquake projects' results frameworks nor evaluation indicators. Publicly disclosing these gender assessments could stimulate dialogue with Haitian women's organizations and make World Bank and IDB post-earthquake operations more gender sensitive.

Data on World Bank and IDB post-earthquake grants by amounts and sectors are presented in Annex 1. The remainder of this report and Annex 2 summarize and provide gender analyses of the banks' rural-focused projects. The report closes with recommendations promoting women's participation in gender sensitive development projects in Haiti; an end to the banks' rural sector privatization that benefits transnational corporations but undermines small farmers' livelihoods and social welfare; and greater World Bank and IDB project transparency.

World Bank Post-Earthquake Agriculture & Rural Development Grants

Rural Community Driven Development Project

The \$16 million Rural Community Driven Development Project constitutes the only approved World Bank post-earthquake investment with a rural focus, as of mid-October. This project is also the Bank's only grant that cited a gender assessment. The project represents a second round of funding to support the Bank's ongoing community development and decentralization efforts in rural areas of Haiti. It develops a mechanism for strengthening local Community-Based Organizations (CBOs), whose citizen members can identify investment needs and access funds to meet them. It transfers public resources to CBOs in "poor rural and peri-urban communities" through the creation of 'Community Development Councils (CADECs) that include CBOs and local government representatives. While the project addresses some gender issues and newly mandates the participation of women, it has gender weaknesses that include the following:

- A disproportionately higher percentage of men than women who are involved in community decision-making processes
- A lack of sex-disaggregated data showing income generation effects by gender
- A new community development council (CADEC) that only requires a 15% participation of women, thereby setting the stage for long-term inequitable community representation

More detailed missed project opportunities include that: (1) Monitoring and evaluation indicators fail to mention sex-disaggregated data showing differential project effects on women and men; (2) The cited gender assessment report, which has not yet been made public, has not been integrated into this project evaluation system; and (3) CADEC membership presents an alarming disparity between men and women: First, the project included only a 30% target participation of women in CBOs and succeeded in securing only a 28% inclusion in the end. Second, the project planned for only a 15% participation rate of women in the new CADECs. Although CADECs were able to exceed this goal, the final representation of women in this key and potentially long-term decision-making body was only 17%. Surely this project could strive for greater gender equality.

Inter-American Bank (IDB) Post-Earthquake Agriculture & Rural Development Grants

assigns \$35,000 (less than one percent of total project funds) for implementation of a Gender Action Plan (GAP) based on community focus group sessions, to help improve opportunities for women in the agriculture sector.

Of 44 IDB approved post-earthquake grants, three mainly address agriculture and rural development. They have minimal gender focus. IDB grants that invest in the rural sector include: (1) Mango as an Opportunity for Long-Term Economic Growth; (2) the Rural Water and Sanitation Program targeting Haiti's rural zones, particularly the Artibonite; and (3) a Bioenergy Action Plan that seeks to promote alternative biofuels energy with goals to increase demand for agricultural products and generate employment in rural areas. Project documents are only available for (1) and (2), but not yet for (3) which was approved by the IDB Board in late August 2010.

Mango as an Opportunity for Long-Term Economic Growth

This project aims to commercialize Haiti's mango sector. Coca-Cola, USAID and the Clinton Bush Haiti Fund are co-grantors and Technoserv is the implementing agency. Stated outcomes include improving income growth opportunities for smallholder farmers and other stakeholders in the mango value chain and moving towards a more processed mango export market. While the project seeks to organize small producers and increase their productivity and participation in the mango value chain, it will actually shift mango production away from traditional cooperatives to privatized commercial business structures. Besides undermining Haiti's traditional small producer model, this project presents an alarming change for women, as cooperatives have traditionally provided needed social programs for poor and vulnerable groups. Gender Action has documented how development bank privatization ventures deepen poverty for poor women and men while enriching corporations and local elites.⁵

The project does emphasize that building local capacity and knowledge and investing in human capital could benefit women, and monitoring and impact evaluations are important. While the project promotes environmental assessments, it makes no provision for gender assessments. Women do not play a central role in the project design or results framework and the evaluation system requires no specific gender assessments to measure the project's differential impacts on men and women. This does not bode well for Haitian women farmers, since project plans that fail to target women overwhelmingly tend to exclude women.

Rural Water and Sanitation Program

This project, focusing exclusively on the Artibonite department, aims to increase the number of rural households with access to sustainable water and sanitation services in rural communities. Remarkably, the project proposal does not mention women or gender, despite the fact that rural women are responsible for fetching water for their households. In addition, the publicly disclosed project documents do not provide sex-disaggregated data.

The project will establish public fountains as potable water sources and community latrines. Safety factors surround both public fountains and community latrines in Haiti; women and girls risk potential attacks when they fetch water at public fountains and use latrines in unsecure public environments. Proper lighting and security should therefore play a central role in water and sanitation planning, in order to help reduce the risk of gender-based violence. However, the project proposal does not address such critical security needs. Although the project will establish community water committees and conduct community outreach campaigns, it does not target women as main beneficiaries or include indicators and mandates for women's participation in community water committees.

Recommendations

Gender Action recommends that:

⁵ See for example: Dennis, Suzanna and Elaine Zuckerman. December 2006. [Gender Guide to World Bank and IMF Policy-Based Lending](#). Gender Action.

- World Bank and IDB investments should not privatize agriculture production. Privatization benefits transnational corporations at the expense of poor, mostly female, farmers. This report discusses how the IDB's mango project not only provides Coca-Cola and other foreign corporations opportunities to extract value that belongs to Haitian farmers but also destroys social programs of Haitian small farming cooperatives that especially benefit women.
- All World Bank and IDB investments should routinely and systematically involve Haitian women's groups and grassroots social movements in project design, implementation and evaluation. Consultation should potentially include Haitian groups and movements ready to hold these public banks accountable, not only groups and movements approved by the banks.
- The World Bank and IDB should publicly disseminate and integrate recommendations from their own pre-earthquake gender assessments.
- The U.S. Treasury Department should authorize U.S. Executive Directors sitting on these banks' Boards of Directors to mandate the inclusion of comprehensive gender assessments and quotas for the full participation of women, including in leadership roles, in all Haitian redevelopment projects.

Annex 1
World Bank and Inter-American Bank (IDB):
Haiti Post-Earthquake Track Record
Gender, Agriculture and Rural Development

Haiti: Approved WB & IDB Post-Earthquake Investments
 Compiled by: Lisa Vitale, Gender Action

	Number of Projects	Amount of Approved Projects	Projects by Sector⁶
World Bank Grants	7	\$146,000,000	Emergency Response & Recovery Funds - 2 Education - 2 Energy - 1 Rural - 1 Misc - 1
IFC Loans	2	\$42,500,000	Emergency Loans - 1 Tourism - 1
Inter-American Development Bank Grants	44	\$233,248,484	HESAR ⁷ - 16 Energy - 6 Economic Development - 5 Sanitation - 5 Government - 4 Shelter - 3 Health - 2 Response & Recovery Funds - 2 Tourism - 1 Education - 1 Transport - 1 Agriculture - 1
Inter-American Investment Corporation	0	\$0	
Grand Total of Projects	53	\$421,748,484.00	

⁶ Some projects fall under multiple sectors. Therefore, the number of projects by sector does not equal the number of current active projects.

⁷ HESAR stands for Haiti Emergency Spending Allocation Request.

Annex 2
World Bank and Inter-American Bank (IDB):
Haiti Post-Earthquake Track Record
Gender, Agriculture and Rural Development

World Bank Grant:

Rural Community Driven Development - Additional Financing II

May 27, 2010 \$16.2 Million

Description

The World Bank Community Driven Development Grant in Haiti represents a second round of funding to support ongoing community development and decentralization efforts in rural areas of Haiti. According to the World Bank's rationale for additional funding, "The Project was designed to help to break the cycle of exclusion via a mechanism for strengthening local Community-Based Organizations (CBOs), and to provide a means through which citizens could agree on their most pressing investment needs and access funds to meet them." It creates a series of new CADECS (Community Development Councils) that are composed of CBOs and local governments. CADECS claim to have long-term sustainability goals. They aim to disperse and manage funds for local projects.

Gender Analysis and Recommendations

Whereas CBOs have 30% participation of women, the new, externally constructed CADECS have only 17% participation of women. These CADECS represent new power structures that reflect a 40% decrease in women's participation in community decision-making.

No sex-disaggregated data exists for these community development projects.

A gender assessment report in connection with the first round of funding exists, yet it has not yet been made public. This could constitute a potentially positive model for other World Bank projects, if its information becomes transparent and accessible, and it presents sex-disaggregated data and gendered planning and evaluation.

This project must reverse retarding the women's participation rate in Haitian community decision-making bodies. Instead, it should increase women's participation to parity with men.

Inter-American Development Bank Grants:

HA-M1034: Mango as an opportunity for long-term economic growth

June 2, 2010 \$3.05 Million

Description

The project claims to contribute to improving income growth opportunities for smallholder farmers and other actors in the mango value chain. The objective is to develop a sustainable and inclusive value chain business model that increases the income of at least 15,000 smallholder mango farmers, creates employment and enhances fresh and processed mango exports. The project will seek to organize small producers and increase their productivity and their participation into the mango value chain. It is expected that this model can be replicated in other value chain sectors in Haiti. However,

the project model, based on replacing traditional small farmer cooperatives with private corporate structures, undermines small farmer livelihoods.

Gender Analysis and Recommendations

One of the objectives of this project is to create or strengthen organizations made up of small mango producers called Producer Business Groups (PBGs). The already existing National Association of Mango Exporters (ANEM) is supposed to be a part of this process. However, PBGs have the potential to constitute new business structures that differ from the traditional cooperatives. Cooperatives have included social programs that supported women farmers. A more commercialized business structure has the potential to reduce the inclusion of women and/or limit social programs that might be most beneficial to women.

The project is run by Technoserv with additional grant funding from Coca-Cola Company. Project outcomes are expected to increase value chain design and create factories and centers to enhance mango products, including potentially producing mango juice that can be bought by Coca-Cola.

As no gender assessments exist within this project, the questions arise: Will women have access to these jobs? What will labor and work conditions be like? Will women be in any positions of leadership?

This project places a strong emphasis on monitoring and impact evaluations. It establishes a good framework for environmental assessments. However, no gender assessments or mention of women exists, despite the fact that 65% of rural producers are made up of women.

The IDB project document states that the "project will have a transformative role beyond project activities. This will be achieved through: (a) engaging local private and public sector actors and nonprofit sector partners; (b) establishing long-term market linkages between key parties; (c) building local capacity, through knowledge transfer, and enhancing the enabling environment; and (d) investing in human capital through collaboration with local private and public institutions and hiring local project staff." Building local capacity through knowledge transfer, investing in human capital and engaging the nonprofit sector can all have positive benefits for women. However, without any gendered budgeting, planning or evaluation, these potential benefits can be lost. In addition, negative repercussions can include a widening gap between male leaders and female subordinates, the exclusion of women and/or lack of access to jobs.

HA-X1014 : Rural Water and Sanitation Program (II)

June 10, 2010 \$10 Million

Description

This project is complimentary to and supports previous water and sanitation programs in Haiti, with this project focusing exclusively on the Artibonite department, which has in the past been neglected due to financial constraints. The project aims to improve the quality of life and sanitary conditions of rural communities through the provision of sustainable potable water and sanitation services. The purpose of the program is to increase the number of households with access to sustainable water and sanitation services in rural communities.

Gender Analysis and Recommendations

The project proposal fails to mention women once despite the aim of the project to bring potable water access to rural areas, which women fetch for their households.

No sex-disaggregated data for this project exists.

The project will establish public fountains to distribute drinking water and family latrines. Safety factors surround both public fountains and community latrines; women and girls are repeatedly attacked when they fetch water from public sources and use public latrines. Proper lighting and security should be taken into consideration, but the project does not provide for them. The project will establish community water committees and conduct community outreach campaigns, but fails to mention whom the target audience of the campaigns will be, or establish an inclusion rate of women for the community water committees.

HA-X1017 : BIOENERGY ACTION PLAN (COFAB component)

August 26, 2010 \$150,000

Description

This plan seeks to promote the development of biofuels as an alternative energy source through the diversification of the energy mix, reducing dependence on foreign fuel supply, environmental sustainability, increased demand for agricultural products, and generating employment in rural areas. Haitians are expected to know the potential of the biofuels industry in Haiti and through this mechanism be able to access carbon credits and opportunities of the Kyoto Protocol. The cost of the cooperation is covered by IDB - operation HA-T1077, the Organization of American States (OAS) through this Grant Co-financing Contribution (COFAB) and by local support that will be provided in kind.

Gender Analysis and Recommendations

Since no project documents are available, we merely mention this rural project here, but do not include the project in the main project report.



1875 Connecticut Avenue NW
Suite 500
Washington, DC 20009, USA

(202) 939-5463
www.genderaction.org
info@genderaction.org